

## Recommendations

- a) **Do not draw the line between public and civil society.** In general you should focus on goal to make as many of information, decision-making processes, outcomes (contracts, invoices) public. Any pro-transparent tool suitable for general public should also serve its purpose for activists or CSO's. They all deserve to have the same chance to dick into municipal data or politics.
- b) **E-auctions and Electronic market research** Public procurement should be handle as openly as possible. The best practice is a use of electronic auctioning conducted online, visible to all the participants and to the public in general. After all you are spending public resources so public does deserve to have a change for full unobstructed inside. For higher investments (for example above 3000 EUR) electronic web based auction house is recommended. For lower investments (for example between 3000 and 400 EUR) lighter version often named electronic market research is a good and successful solution. It's less laborious for participants and municipality administrator and more users friendly. The goal in this field is to eliminate human influence or input. The human being should act as an administrator feeding well build and tuned software. Electronic auctioning would not be complete without online archive accessible 24/7. So process and documentation related to all auctions is searchable anytime for everyone. This solution should include links to actual contracts and invoices. This way it is possible to verify if winning bid was really put into corresponding contract and invoice. Of course there are some areas when public procurement cannot be guided by selection process upon lowest price. There are some services where the criteria of lowest price cannot serve the purpose of delivering satisfactory services or goods (marketing and PR services, legal services etc.) Do not forget. According to results you may save 15%, 20% or even more from supposed expenses. I'm sure you already know how effectively you can spend this saved resources.
- c) **Map of electronic auctions** To make a process and the whole idea of transparent public procurement more attractive and easy to make out for general public a good and cheap solution is goggle based map of electronic auctions. In case if there is a specific location related to the investment, the pin is positioned in this position. This pin is accompanied by basic information about public procurement and cross-linked to the corresponding part of electronic archive (tender proposal, process of the tender/bidding, electronic auction, contract, inspection report, invoice etc.)
- d) **Recruitment** Every case of open position should be handled by the same system of transparent rules. First the information should be publish in advance (including minimal required education, experience, deadlines etc.) All applicants should be evaluated within system based on quantification (test, interview, final score) Again part of this solution should be an archive of all executed recruitments accessible 24/7.
- e) **Text messaging - Intelligent address system** The vast majority of general population does own and use cell phones. Use this opportunity to communicate with your population. On one side it easy and relatively cheap deliver essential information via text message. In case of crisis, communication trough text messaging is proven to be very quick and effective way how to reach the targeted community. You can also build a system where public can use text messaging for communication towards municipality. There are many solutions allowing use of text messaging for opinion pool conducted within targeted community. (You can send a simple question and targeted community is replying with tag of preferred option, for example A or B or C) For example this tool can be used on district level as tool for participatory budgeting.

- f) **Electronic opinion pool** This is more sophisticated tool. Electronic opinion pool should be accompanied with option to cast a voice in person for those who do not have the access to internet or insufficient skills. Comparing to opinion pool conducted via text messaging in this case every vote is unique. Part of it is the verification system, so only those who are eligible to vote (age groups, permanent residents, residents of specific district) will be able to cast a vote once. This tool can be used in cases where something bigger or more important is in question. For example case of participatory budgeting, when population is directly choosing favorite project to be financed from city budget.
- g) **Electronic online notes** Electronic web based communication, basically Q&A handled via web site. All questions and answers should remain visible for general public. No censorship is allowed. This should not be a chat so only questions (follow up questions are also eligible) are allowed, not comments. Question can be submitted anonymously. One contact information on side of questioner (e-mail or phone number) should be required, so officials or municipality employees are able to ask additional questions and find out more detailed information about subject in question if needed.
- h) **Smartphone applications** – Communication and follow up via smartphone or tablet. Modern and transparent way how public can submit a suggestion or report directly to municipality. Everyone is able to follow and actually control the process of solving. (Example of one very effective solution [www.citymonitor.sk](http://www.citymonitor.sk) )
- i) **Open doors days in offices of high rank elected officials** First of all this is a very good and forward coming sign for public. The elected official is welcoming visitors repeatedly, for example on monthly basis (every first Monday etc.) Every question, recommendation etc. should be noted. Elected official with help of his staff should look up for answers and solutions. If we do talk about transparency, in this case report from every open door day including questions and answers should be published at least online.
- j) **Day of town districts** This occasion have to give opportunity to meet elected officials in streets. It is recommended to conduct this on monthly basis (for example every second Monday on monthly basis). This happening can take place one by one in each district. Invitation must contain time and route where elected official will walk trough with his staff. Again all questions, recommendations etc. should be noted and later solved if possible. And also in this case, report should be published online. Here general public can meet and point out problems in the streets, many times on the spot. Later report published online can give public a chance to follow up, control and contribute.
- k) **Public database of contracts, orders and invoices** Database accessible online 24/7. With intuitive search and filter tools.
- l) **Make calendar of high rank elected officials public** Some elected officials do believe that if they do serve public and they are paid for this job from public funds, it should not be a secret how they are spending time “on duty”. So they do publish their business calendar. Everybody can see if they meet with the same group of oligarchs, representatives of financial interest groups or if they pay attention to somebody else.
- m) **Diversify control mechanisms** In some cases control mechanism supported by groups of controllers, expert committees etc. can serve the purpose of independent overlook. In order to be able to really say that they really are independent from back round surrounding body which they should control, advise etc. one simple rule must be followed. If you want grand real independence in this control mechanism, the body in control can not be appointed by the same entity as body under control. For example

if a mayor appoints chief architect, committee advising and controlling his office (department of chief architect) can be definitely appointed by somebody else, for example by a city parliament.

- n) **E-newsletter** internal and external can be distributed via e-mails on monthly bases. This way information about pro transparent initiative is spread. You will get a chance to introduce and interpret your goals, approach, plans etc. The misinterpretation is less likely to take a place. You get more understanding, cooperation, and credit for your good intentions.
- o) **Prepare and repeat media campaigns** Any excellent solution and best anti corruption tool or anti corruption project it self will lack a real impact without those for who these tools are designed. Prepare and carry out media campaign explaining what can be done with this tools and directions how to use them. Remember: repeat, repeat and repeat.
- p) **Look for recognition.** Apply for awards, certificates for your new pro transparent and anti corruption movements. On local but even better on international level. It will give more reputation and credibility to your project. If they think your project is good others will more likely pay serious attention too. Sometimes you cannot apply for your self. Cooperate and communicate with third party, they may apply for you. Do not try to apply with this great idea. Be patient and wait at least for one year. You have to be able to prove real effect and sustainability of your project.
- q) **Be prepared to constantly reevaluate and make improvements.** If you try to cut down the wings of corruption. Those who do ride it will constantly try to make it fly anyway – or some other way. Fighting a corruption is never ending story. Don't believe that corruption can be erased for once. If you good you can significantly narrow the path for potential corruption to operate through.
- r) **Try to teach old dogs new ways** – single out transparent way and forget old ways how you used to handle and carry out decisions. If you came up with new – more transparent way single this new rule out and erase old ones.
- s) **Publish entire town council agenda** in full content at least 3 days before town council meeting. So everybody can read it and try to make a difference. Allow public to attend council meetings in person and speak up during debate before final vote takes place.
- t) **Consider use of transparent account in as many areas as possible.** Mayors office, district budget, public school or health care facility. Funded by public assets? Why not allow public to see how this many are spend. You can always look for fair compromise, so you don't publish sensitive information or personal data. For example in area of wages you can publish info how much did you spend on wages this month for how many employees.
- u) **Cut the ties with oligarchs and hidden sponsors.** Come up with new rules, which will make use of transparent account mandatory for the whole funding of pre-election campaigns for all candidates.
- v) **Participatory budgeting.** Decide what part of budget spending you will directly empower public. Maybe 7%? Less? More? In every case this approach will be appreciated. On one hand you will send a clear message that public opinion is valuable for your governance. On other hand you will give them chance to take a responsibility for a part of public life. It doesn't have to be big. At the beginning you can ask if targeted community will prefer parking lots or play ground. Or maybe what color should be painted on so much needed railing keeping school kids running directly into a traffic.

Every solution has a cost. In most cases it can be reached within a weeks or within a few months. It may be more demanding on human resources or on expenses. It may be easy to develop, but in order to keep it running you may have to have to increase a number of staff or budget required in order to keep it really operational. This chart should give you a basic idea how demanding solutions recommended above can be on your budget, human resources or time management.

		development		usage	
tool recommended	ready within	demand on budget	demand on human resources	demand on budget	demand on human resources
E auction	months	heavy	moderate	<b>SAVINGS!</b>	moderate
e market research	months	moderate	moderate	<b>SAVINGS!</b>	moderate
map of E auctions	weeks	minimal	moderate	minimal	moderate
recruitment	weeks	moderate	moderate	minimal	minimal
intelligent adress system	months	moderate	moderate	moderate	minimal
electronic opinion tool	months	heavy	moderate	heavy	moderate
online notes	weeks	moderate	minimal	minimal	moderate
smart phone application	weeks	moderate	minimal	minimal	moderate
open doors days	days	minimal	minimal	minimal	minimal
day of town district	days	minimal	minimal	minimal	minimal
database	months	moderate	moderate	minimal	minimal
public calendar	days	minimal	minimal	minimal	minimal
e-newsletter	weeks	minimal	minimal	minimal	moderate
media campaings	weeks	minimal	moderate	moderate	moderate
council agenda	weeks	minimal	minimal	minimal	minimal

<b>participatory budget</b>	weeks	minimal	moderate	minimal	minimal
<b>transparent account</b>	weeks	minimal	minimal	minimal	minimal